

Ballot Information			
Reference	ISO/IEC FDIS 24754	Committee	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 34
Edition number	1		
English title	Information technology -- Document description and processing languages -- Minimum requirements for specifying document rendering systems -- Part 11:		
French title	Technologies de l'information -- Description des documents et langages de traitement -- Exigences minimales pour spécifier les "document rendering systems" -- Partie 11:		
Start date	2008-04-29	End date	2008-06-29
Opened by ISO/CS on	2008-04-29 00:00:30	Closed by ISO/CS on	2008-07-01 00:00:47
Status	Closed		
Voting stage	Approval	Version number	1
Note			

Result of voting
<p>P-Members voting: 20 in favour out of 20 = 100 % (requirement >= 66.66%)</p> <p><i>(P-Members having abstained are not counted in this vote.)</i></p> <p>Member bodies voting: 0 negative votes out of 20 = 0 % (requirement <= 25%)</p> <p><i>Approved</i></p>

Votes by members					
Country	Member	Status	Approval	Disapproval	Abstention
Algeria	IANOR	P-Member			
Australia	SA	P-Member			X
Azerbaijan	AZSTAND	P-Member			
Belgium	NBN	P-Member			X
Brazil	ABNT	O-Member	X *		
Canada	SCC	P-Member	X		
China	SAC	P-Member	X		
Colombia	ICONTEC	O-Member			X
Côte-d'Ivoire	CODINORM	P-Member			
Czech Republic	CNI	P-Member	X		
Denmark	DS	P-Member			X
Ecuador	INEN	P-Member			X
Egypt	EOS	O-Member	X		
Finland	SFS	P-Member			X
France	AFNOR	P-Member	X		
Germany	DIN	P-Member			X
India	BIS	P-Member	X		
Iran, Islamic Republic of	ISIRI	P-Member			
Ireland	NSAI	P-Member	X		
Italy	UNI	P-Member	X		
Jamaica	BSJ	P-Member	X		
Japan	JISC	P-Member	X *		
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMST	P-Member			
Kenya	KEBS	P-Member	X		
Korea, Republic of	KATS	P-Member	X		
Luxembourg	ILNAS	O-Member	X		
Malaysia	DSM	P-Member			X
Malta	MSA	P-Member			X
Mexico	DGN	O-Member			X *
Netherlands	NEN	P-Member			X
New Zealand	SNZ	P-Member			X
Nigeria	SON	P-Member	X		
Norway	SN	P-Member	X		
Pakistan	PSQCA	P-Member			
Philippines	BPS	P-Member	X		
Russian Federation	GOST R	O-Member	X		

Saudi Arabia	SASO	P-Member			
Singapore	SPRING SG	P-Member			X
Slovenia	SIST	P-Member			X
South Africa	SABS	P-Member			X
Spain	AENOR	P-Member			X
Sweden	SIS	O-Member			X
Switzerland	SNV	P-Member			X *
United Kingdom	BSI	P-Member	X		
Uruguay	UNIT	P-Member			X
USA	ANSI	Secretariat	X *		
Venezuela	FONDONORMA	P-Member			
P-Member TOTALS Total of P-Members voting: 16			16	0	16
TOTALS			20	0	19
(*) A comment file was submitted with this vote					

Comments from Voters			
Brazil	ABNT	O-Member	Brazil(ABNT).doc
Japan	JISC	P-Member	Japan(JISC).doc
Mexico	DGN	O-Member	Mexico(DGN).doc
Switzerland	SNV	P-Member	Switzerland(SNV).doc
USA	ANSI	Secretariat	USA(ANSI).doc

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document: :
-------	-------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
BR	3.2.3		Ed	The sentence "...footerm sidebars, multiple flows." Should be changed.	Change to "... footerm sidebars and multiple flows.	
BR	Annex A		Ed	Mentions to CRT and LCD should be changed.	Change texts to "LCD monitor" and "CRT monitor"	
BR	A.1.7		Ed	Then sentence "... coded by UTF-8, UTF-16, UTF-32BE" should be changed.	Change sentence to "...coded by UTF-8, UTF-16 or UTF-32BE"	
BR	3.1.11		Ed	Lack of punctuation at the end of the sentence	Insert the final punctuation mark at the end of the sentence	
BR	2.3		Ed	The sentence "... in order processes a document"	Change the sentence to "... in order to process a document"	
BR	3.1.5		Ed	Lack of comma in sentence "Colour system, e.g. RGB and CMYK and depth of colour, e.g. 8-bit (256 colours) and 24-bit (16 million colours)."	Change sentence to "Colour system, e.g. RGB and CMYK, and depth of colour, e.g. 8-bit (256 colours) and 24-bit (16 million colours)."	
BR	3.1.2, 3.1.4, 3.1.7, 3.1.8, 3.6.3, 3.6.8, 3.7.1, 3.7.2, 3.8.2, 3.9.x, A.1.10		Ed	Redundant use of 'e.g' with 'etc'. According to http://www.wsu.edu/~brians/errors/e.g.html "Since e.g. indicates a partial list, it is redundant to add "etc." at the end of a list introduced by this abbreviation"	Remove the redundant 'etc' word.	
BR	A.6.8		Ed	The sentence "separate alignment the last line in a block" should be changed	Change the sentence to "separate alignment of the last line in a block".	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2008-05-13	Document: FDIS 24754
------------------	-----------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
JP	A.1.9		ed		"ISO-IR 127" should be replaced with "G1 of ISO/IEC 8859-6".	

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CH	3.1.2		te	Typically a reference to the short name of a document format such as "XML", "RTF", "ODF", "OOXML" does not fully specify the set of acceptable input documents, since very commonly not all features of the input document format are implemented, and in addition some extensions beyond the standard features may be implemented.	Add at the end of the subsection: "For each supported document format, an explicit reference to a specific version of the document format specification is provided. If the document format is implemented only partially and/or extended, an explicit reference to a 'profile' specification detailing the restrictions and/or extensions is provided."	
CH	3.1.3		te	Style specification languages can also be partially implemented or extended.	Add at the end of the subsection: "For each supported style specification language, an explicit reference to a specific version of the style specification language specification is provided. If the style specification language is implemented only partially and/or extended, an explicit reference to a 'profile' specification detailing the restrictions and/or extensions is provided."	
CH	A.1.7	first sentence	te	The meaning of this sentence is grammatically unclear.	Clarify e.g. as follows: "Considering the fact that some character sets are designed for specific character encodings, it may be appropriate to provide the list of acceptable encoding schemes separately for each character set."	
CH				Swiss vote on FDIS 24754 SNV vote ABSTAIN for the following reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> We cannot vote APPROVE, as we do not unconditionally approve its "technical content as presented", as required by the JTC1 Directives, clause 9.7. We do not vote DISAPPROVE, as we hesitate to delay a FDIS to which we did not make contributions at CD stage.		
CH						

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2008-06-12

Document: ISO/IEC FDIS 24754

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CH						
CH	Entire document		te	The entire document lacks any notion of cross-vendor compatibility, which is, in our opinion, a k.o. criterium for a document rendering system.	Add cross-vendor interoperability to the list of minimum requirements for specifying document rendering systems.	
CH						
CH						

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 16 May 2008	Document: V1-N2008-32- US Corrections to FDIS 24754
-------------------	--

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
US	2.2		ed	Grammar	"a rendered document have" should be: "a rendered document has"	
US	3.1.1		ed	Incorrect case	"Printing" should be "printing"	
US	3.2.3		ed	Missing conjunction	"sidebars, multiple flows." to "sidebars, and multiple flows."	
US	Annex		ed	Incorrect internal references	each A.x[.x] occurrence incorrectly references material in 4.x[.x] which does not exist, instead they should be to material in 3.x[.x].	
US	Annex		ed	Inconsistent examples	most of the examples have a lower-case first character, but in A.1.1, A.1.9, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.5.1, A.6.2, and A.6.4, there are first characters that are instead upper-case	

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.